

The development of philosophy in early childhood pedagogy: Western, Eastern, and national perspectives


Raden Roro Anisa Anggi Dinda ^{1*}, Maulana Gilar Nugraha ²

¹ Gadjah Mada, University, Indonesia

² Gadjah Mada, University Indonesia.

¹ radenroroanisaanggidinda490699@mail.ugm.ac.id; ² maulana.gilar.n@mail.ugm.ac.id

*Correspondent Author

KEYWORDS	ABSTRACT
Early Childhood Education Philosophy of Education Pedagogy Student	<p>Pedagogy, especially concerning early childhood, has become a topic area that has developed rapidly in the last few decades. Through this article, the development of pedagogical philosophy will be explained in both Western, Eastern, and national perspectives. Early childhood education that is seen around us is the result of the thoughts of previous philosophers and thinkers who developed in accordance with other sciences. The influence of the development of science makes early childhood education have a variety of approaches and certain methods so that learning activities become effective. Moreover, various pedagogical philosophies view children as students from different perspectives. The relationship between students and teachers also has its own dynamics. The debate over the shifting pedagogical philosophy will also be discussed. If in the past the debate was still about how important children's education was, so that in the end, it gave rise to many methods and thoughts, now the philosophy of education has entered a phase of questioning education itself.</p> <p>This is an open-access article under the CC-BY-SA license.</p> 

Introduction

Once upon a time, when the concepts of philosophy and science were developing rapidly, only privileged adults were able to develop the paradigm of certain thoughts and pour them into writings until they could finally be passed on from generation to generation until now. Early thinkers sought to explain knowledge with their own critical thoughts. As the times progress, humans do not need to go through a complicated and long process to be able to understand science like previous people. The science that has been formed and inherited was "brought in" to teach humans through more-knowledge-able-other. This process we often say with education.

Nowadays, education does not only revolve around adults and certain people. Children who initially occupied the status of second-class citizens began to be considered an important part that contributed to social society. This concept developed when Western societies began to pay more attention to parenting (Farquhar & White, 2014). This has led to shifts in areas such as

public policy and planning to the point of impacting the development of formal curricula. Education for early childhood is expected to be able to provide an understanding of children how to socialize and have a good society so that later these children will be able to carry out their respective roles as citizens optimally in the future (Moss, 2013).

There are many different views, ideologies, theories, and approaches used to help the process of transferring knowledge in children. Different physical and psychological conditions make this process unique. The development of sciences related to children and education such as developmental psychology, pediatrics, and neurosciences, influenced various policies on a national and international scale, as well as shifting the philosophy of early childhood education pedagogy. Through the literature review analysis method, this article will discuss the development of pedagogical philosophy, especially regarding early childhood education, and its challenges in the future.

The main question in this literature review is to what extent has the philosophy of early childhood pedagogy shifted and what will the future development of early childhood pedagogy look like? There are four things that will be studied in the discussion section. The first part is about the understanding and philosophy of early childhood pedagogy. Second, the development of early childhood pedagogy in the West. Third, the development of early childhood pedagogy in the East. And lastly is a prediction of the future development of early childhood pedagogy.

The Philosophy of Early Childhood Pedagogy

According to Etymonline (2022), the word "pedagogy" comes from the ancient Greek *παιδαγωγέω* (*paidagōgeō*). The word is a combination of the words *παῖς* (*país*) which means "child" and *άγω* (*ági*) which means "to guide". In ancient Greece, the word *paidagōgos* referred to slaves who supervised the education of their master's child, including escorting him to school or training grounds, nurturing him, and bringing provisions (Lucas, 1972). Literally, *paidagōgeō* means "to guide the child". In the absorption into Old French, the word *pedogoge* means teacher for children. In 1580, this word (*pédagogie*) underwent a shift in meaning to "the science of teaching".

According to Loughran (2010), contemporary understanding of pedagogy is the art of being a teacher, which includes teaching techniques and methods. There are two basic conceptions of pedagogy. First, the liberal conception, emphasizes the independence and autonomy of the child, and second, the conservatist conception, which puts more emphasis on the authority of the teacher.

In its development, contemporary pedagogy is in line with the child-centered liberal

conception. Progressive educational figures such as Rousseau, Pestalozzi, Dewey, and Piaget hold the view that children develop naturally, and they are active learners. The development of positivistic schools that uphold empirical research makes these findings used as the main reference so that currently teaching and learning activities are no longer only teacher-centered. Nonetheless, there is still debate over this consensus. Biesta (2007) reveals that the consensus ignores the epistemological and ontological underlying teaching and learning.

This debate is still a hot topic in the education area. The concept of pedagogy itself is also still questionable such as *"What does it mean to teach? What does it mean to learn? What does it mean to be human? What and whose knowledge is important?"*. According to Farquhar & White (2014), finally, pedagogy itself becomes an important connection that connects between teaching, learning, knowledge, society, and even politics. Pedagogy is also involved in a social vision and society that depends on future generations.

Given the urgency in terms of pedagogy, globally, various countries are currently starting to focus on policies on early childhood education (ECE) or in the West often referred to as Early Childhood Education (ECE). Organizations such as the Council of the European Union and the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) pay special attention to the ECE curriculum to be more contained, coherent, and also controlled (Wood, 2016). In Indonesia itself, the Directorate General of Early Childhood Education and Community Education was formed through Presidential Regulation Number 14 of 2015 and has the task of organizing the formulation and implementation of policies in the field of early childhood education.

The Development of Early Childhood Pedagogy in The West

From the mid-17th century to the end of the 18th century, developments in the social, economic, and intellectual spheres tended to stagnate. In the late 18th and early 19th centuries, as Europe expanded massively, commercial competition arose that changed the social fabric of society. The invention of the steam engine and the creation of large-scale factories also influenced social and economic transformation, as well as made industrialism, urbanization, and also mass workers.

At the same time, intellectuals and philosophers gave strong protests related to economic change, social inequality, injustice, and intolerance. They develop ideas related to the value of the individual. Each individual is a unique and valuable person. It was this idea that eventually inspired the political revolution. Finally, there was a widespread psychological change: people's confidence in their power to use various resources, rule over nature, and structure

their own future, increased, surpassing previous self-confidence, and this belief on a national scale—in the form of nationalism—moved all groups to fight for them to be free to manage their own affairs.

One of the famous philosophers at that time was Jean-Jacques Rousseau. Rousseau was one of the philosophers whose philosophy influenced the French Revolution (Gibson, 1928). His greatest thought at the time was that a good state is one that reflects the sovereignty of the people. Apart from being a political basis, his views also influenced Education. In his opinion, education should meet the individual needs of each child, and the child's impulses should not be limited.

One of Rousseau's famous followers was the Swiss educationist Johann Heinrich Pestalozzi. Pestalozzi argues that children are inherently good-natured. The growth and development that occurs in children take place gradually and continuously. This opinion of his made him one of the pioneers in humanistic educators (Bowers & Gehring, 2004).

In the late 19th and early 20th centuries, the first and second world wars devastated education. Social, racial, and ideological conflicts make the development of education tend to stagnate. The difference between the upper class and the lower class has become very lame. In addition, although the population of the world community is increasing, the birth rate of Western countries tends to decrease. The growth of large industries has made Western countries very dependent on science and technology. The above affects the sociopsychology of all walks of life.

Post-war, industries in various countries continued to develop. This encourages the need for workers with qualified skills and knowledge. To meet these needs, the Education sector began to be improved. Research on teaching approaches has also begun to be carried out in order to meet this need.

Johann Friedrich Herbart was a philosopher from Germany who was among the first scientists to apply scientific methods in the field of Education. Then at the end of the 19th century, the German psychologist Wilhelm Max Wundt built the first psychology laboratory at the University of Leipzig. Although the findings of both were influential in the world of education, those times are considered a point of separation between philosophy and psychology.

At the beginning of the decade of the 20th century, there was a progressive education movement as part of the Progressive Movement (Sadovnik et al., 2017). Primary education began to spread in Western countries, although the level of literacy and social understanding of people was still low related to the importance of education. To make public policy related to

this, various experimental schools were formed in America such as the University of Chicago Laboratory School which was founded in 1896 and led by John Dewey; the Francis W. Parker School was founded in 1901 in Chicago; the School of Organic Education at Fairhope, Ala., founded by Marietta Johnson in 1907; and also, the experimental elementary school at the University of Missouri (Columbia) in 1904 by Junius L. Meriam. These schools are created to formulate activities, goals, and values embraced by the Education system.

The approach taken by Western countries at that time was child-centered education, which was an influence of Rousseau's philosophy as well as Pestalozzi (Bowers & Gehring, 2004). One of the pioneers in implementing this philosophy in schools in America was Francis W. Parker. She overhauled traditional school methods and emphasized "quality teaching," which performs strategy and focuses on activity, creative self-expression, personal understanding, and personality development.

The same philosophy is also carried out for students with physical and mental disabilities. Even so, the approach taken is somewhat different. Teachers are required to find their own methods for them to be able to meet the needs of their privileged pupils, which ordinary schools cannot afford to meet. When these methods are successful, the question arises whether if the same method is applied to physically and mentally healthy children, the results will be better. At the beginning of the 20th century, an educator from Rome, Maria Montessori, and from Brussels, Ovide Decroly, successfully applied this method to normal children in their own schools. (Marshall, 2017).

Maria Montessori created a revolution in the world of early childhood education through the construction of a *casa dei bambini* or children's house, in Rome in 1907. His approach method was later turned into a book entitled "The Montessori Method" in 1912 and became a reference for various world education figures today. In his book, Montessori suggests ways in which "auto-education" can be applied to early childhood (Montessori, 2019).

One of the famous Montessori quotes is "If education recognizes the intrinsic value of a child's personality, and gives the right feel to his spiritual growth, we reveal a whole new child, whose stunning character can ultimately contribute to a better world." - Maria Montessori.

This theory explains the existence of the child as a very essential period for the whole of his life. In addition to this, Maria Montessori initiated numerous examples of child development concepts such as a Child's Self-Construction, which states that children build their own mental development, Sensitive Periods, which refer to sensitive periods in early childhood, and an absorbent mind which means that early childhood has a soul absorbing various knowledge and experiences in life (Pitcher, 1966).

Initially, Montessori's theory was criticized that the extensive exercises and approaches undertaken to the child's development were considered unnecessary and unimportant. This criticism is delivered by Most supporters of conservative Darwinism where they believe that the only determinant of child development is the factor of nature or heredity. Another criticism was also delivered by the Freudians who denigrated the Montessori revolution whose learning materials increased the spontaneity of learning in children. But in 1915, Montessori was greeted with enthusiasm in America. He even lectured and opened courses for teachers in California. He also founded a Montessori class at the San Francisco World Exhibition that same year. After returning to Europe, he gave lectures in several countries and continued to conduct research, and many awards he received (Montessori, 2019).

In the same period, Charlotte Mason, a senior educator from England, published 6 volumes of her book on the philosophy of Education for home and school. It offers a rich, high-quality, and inclusive curriculum. This curriculum is not only to educate children but also to guide their character development and make them enthusiastic about becoming lifelong learners (Sendra Ramos, 2022). Charlotte Mason has five basic principles related to Education, the first of which is a child is a full person. Mason believes that although children are not miniature adults, children are fully human. They are not passive beings; they just need guidance to be able to be active in the search for existing ideas. Second, Education is the "science of relations", meaning Mason thinks that children have a desire always to be connected and connected to the world around them.

The third principle is Children deserve a rich curriculum. Mason believes children can explain things well if they access good learning materials. This principle makes Mason's "living book" philosophy famous, in which he considers that learning materials are not only centered on textbooks but also native materials from nature. The fourth principle is that Learning should be teacher-guided and self-directed. Mason does not suggest children have their own curriculum. Teachers must play a role in designing a curriculum that is good and broad, even if it is not rigid and specific. Mason believes that teachers have far more experience than children to be able to make good instructions and curricula.

Finally, there are atmosphere educates. When children learn something, Mason believes that children will be affected by the surrounding atmosphere. Whether the child will be polite or not, honest or not, lazy or not, it all depends on the learning atmosphere built in the home and school. This is later important for the development of children's character and behaviour (Cooper, 2014). In the middle of the 20th century, the theory of psychological theory began to develop a lot. In addition to behaviourism, structuralism has also begun to be widely discussed,

including in terms of education and development of children. Jean Piaget is a Swiss psychologist and educator, best known for his structured theory of learning and for saying that children's intelligence develops based on various stages.

In 1927, Jean Piaget researched and wrote about cognitive development. Unlike previous psychologists, Piaget stated that children's way of thinking is not only immature because they lose knowledge with adults, but in quality, children's way of thinking is indeed different from that of adults. According to his research, the stages of individual development and age changes affect the learning ability of individuals.

Piaget calls these cognitive structures schemas, that is, collections of schemes. An individual person can bind, understand, and respond to a stimulus caused by the work of these schemata. This schema develops chronologically, because of the interaction between the individual and his environment. Thus, a more mature individual has a more complete cognitive structure, so his way of thinking is much different than when he was a child.

In addition to his theory of schemata, Piaget also contributed to the cognitive development of children through the stages of development he described. According to him, everyone develops chronologically according to his age. These stages are the Motor Sensory stage (0 - 2 years), pre-Operational (2 - 7 years), Concrete Operations (7 - 11 years), and Formal Operations (age 11 years and above) (Slavin, 2018).

The theory of development presented by Jean Piaget, although phenomenal, still received criticism from various circles. One of them is from a psychologist of Russian origin Lev Vygotsky. Vygotsky did not consider Piaget a rival, he precisely greatly admired the works of Piaget. Vygotsky agrees with Piaget's theory that cognitive development occurs gradually, but Vygotsky disagrees with Piaget's view that the child explores his own world and forms a picture of his reality from his own mind. According to Vygotsky, some knowledge is not only acquired by the child himself, but he gets that knowledge through the help of his environment as well.

Vygotsky's thoughts regarding Education and cognitive development had three main ideas. First, intellectuals thrive at a time when individuals are facing innovative ideas and it is difficult to associate those ideas with what they know. Secondly, interaction with others enriches intellectual development. From these two ideas emerged the term Zone Proximal Development (ZPD). ZPD is a term Vygotsky uses to describe conditions where there are tasks that are difficult for children to master themselves, but if they are assisted by adults or smarter people, then they can do them. It is this zone that, according to Vygotsky, allows children to develop.

The third idea of Vygotsky is the teacher has the key role of acting as an aide and mediator

of student learning. From this comes the term the-more-knowledgeable-adult (Slavin, 2018). At the end of the 20th century, a new educational philosophy was born in Northern Italy. Reggio Emilia created a special approach to early childhood education. This philosophy is widely used in North America and Scandinavian countries such as Sweden, Denmark, Finland, and Norway, until recently. This philosophy was influenced a lot by the thoughts of Vygotsky, who considered that children develop their theory and knowledge through their relationship with others and the surrounding environment (Dahlberg, et al., 1999).

There are eight main focuses in Reggio Emilia's approach, the first being the environment as the third teacher. The teacher is not only human but also the environment. Second, the multiple languages of the children, which states that children not only communicate verbally but also non-verbal. Third, long-term projects, where Education should focus on the long-term effects on children. Fourth is the teacher researcher, where the teacher not only gives rigid directions but also makes certain observations according to student development, making learning more dynamic.

Fifth, the image of the children. Emilia sees children as powerful, competent, creative, curious, full of potential, and ambition. Sixth, is negotiable learning, where when a debate occurs, children participate in negotiations and collaborate with teachers to solve problems. Seventh, documentation. This documentation proposed by Emilia influenced many forms of activity that early childhood carried out to date. Emilia argues that child development needs to be documented into something visible and concrete to clarify individual progress. Finally, there are social relations. Emilia considers that children are active social agents, which can make learning more dynamic through the relationships they create with their respective teachers (Santin & Torruella, 2017).

The Development of Early Childhood Pedagogy in The East

If the development of pedagogy in the West is well documented and comprehensive, the sources regarding the development of pedagogy in the East seem 'scattered' and singular. But the recorded sources are actually older in age. Such as the works published by Al-Ghazali.

Al-Ghazali came from a town in Khurasan, Persia. He was a Persian ruler and had family ties to the kings who ruled the regions of Khurasan, Jibal, Iraq, Persia, and Ahwaj. At the age of 33, Al-Ghazali was appointed Professor at the Nizhamiyah University in Baghdad, and he gained a high position in the world of science in his time. Nizhamul Mulk became increasingly interested in Al-Ghazali's abilities, so Al-Ghazali was invited to move to Mu'askar, the prime minister's residence and the residence of State officials and clerics in the science section (Abuddin, 2003).

In the concept of Education that he offers, Al-Ghazali said that the goal of Long-term Education is actually a means of approaching oneself to Allah. Education in the process must lead man towards the recognition and then approach of the self to the God who created nature. In its development, Al-Ghazali made a hadith as his handle, namely "whoever adds knowledge (worldliness) but does not add hidayah, he does not get closer to Allah, and instead gets farther and farther from Him." (H.R. Dailami of Ali). According to this concept, it can be stated that the longer a person sits in education, the more knowledge he gets, and the closer he gets to God.

In the development of the curriculum concept, Al-Ghazali divided knowledge into three parts, namely The cursed sciences either little or many, namely the sciences that have no benefit, the sciences that are commendable both few and many, that is, the sciences that are closely related to worship and its kinds, and the commendable sciences in a certain degree, or few, and despicable if studied in depth, because studying them in depth can cause chaos and the interconnectedness of belief and doubt and can also lead to paganism, such as philosophy.

Regarding learning methods, Al-Ghazali's attention is more devoted to the teaching of religious education for children. For this, he has exemplified a method of exemplary mental children, the cultivation of ethics, and the cultivation of virtues in them. Since exemplary is important to him, Al-Ghazali specifically and in detail sets out the conditions, duties, and qualities of a teacher in the book he wrote, namely *Ihya 'Ulum Al-Din* (Shafique, 2005).

The philosophy of education does not only come from abroad. Indonesia itself has the father of national education Ki Hadjar Dewantara. Ki Hadjar Dewantara proposed several educational concepts to realize the achievement of educational goals, namely the Tri Education Center: (1) family education; (2) education in the realm of college; and (3) education in the realm of youth or society.

Ki Hadjar Dewantara incorporates culture in children and inserts children into culture from an early age, namely Taman Indria (toddlers). This learning concept is Tri No, namely nonton (cognitive), niteni (affective), and nirokke (psychomotor) (Dwiwarso, 2010). When students have stepped on Taman Muda (Elementary School) education, then Taman Dewasa, and so on, the educational concepts of Ki Hadjar Dewantara are Ngerti (cognitive), Ngroso (affective), and Nglakoni (psychomotor). The final part of the outcome of education is producing resilient human beings in people's lives. The human being in question is a moral human being Taman Siswa, who is able to carry out the Tri Tatangan which includes not abusing authority or power, not doing financial manipulation, and not violating decency (Ki Suratman, 1987).

In addition to Ki Hadjar Dewantara, Indonesia also has Hamka. The nature of education according to Hamka is divided into 2 parts, first, is physical education, namely education for

physical growth and perfection as well as the strength of soul and reason. Second, ruhani education, that is, education for the perfection of human nature in science and experience based on religion. Both physical and spiritual elements have a tendency to develop, and to develop both is through education because education is the most appropriate means of determining the optimal development of these two elements.

Hamka distinguishes the meaning between education and teaching. According to him, education is a series of efforts made by educators to help educate the disposition, mind, morals, and personality of students. While teaching is an attempt to fill intellectual learners with a certain amount of science. The difference between the two understandings is actually only in the meaning, but in essence, it does not distinguish between them. Both words contain integral and complementary meanings in order to achieve the same goal. Because, in every educational process, in it, there is a teaching process. The goals and mission of education will be achieved through the teaching process. Likewise, the teaching process will not mean much if it is not accompanied by an educational process.

The purpose of education according to Hamka has two dimensions; happiness in the world and in the hereafter. To achieve this goal, man must carry out his duties well, namely worship. Therefore, all educational processes ultimately aim to be able to lead and make students good servants of God. Educational materials in Hamka's view basically range between science, charity, and morals, as well as justice. These three sciences are very underlying in the educational process. Science (according to Hamka) is of two kinds, namely science derived from the revelation that is absolutely true and science derived from human reason which is relatively truthful. Knowledge must be based on faith, because if a person who is knowledgeable without being based on faith then his knowledge can harm himself and others.

Charity and morals (in Hamka's view), it turns out that knowledge is not enough just to be accompanied by faith, but must also be accompanied by charity, work, or effort. For him, knowledge that is not followed by charitable deeds is useless to live. Good knowledge will imprint itself outside of the individual and others. The science of knowledge must be practiced and Islam is both a religion of science and charity. Justice (in Hamka's view) means to be upright in the middle, And more fully Hamka explains justice as a defense that captivates the heart and causes people to be submissive and obedient with all humility. This concept of justice must be contained elements of equality, independence, and ownership.

Education according to Hamka must have the principle of tawhid. Education with tawhid as the main principle will add value to man and foster confidence in himself and have the right life handle. As can be seen from the nature, purpose, material, and principles of education,

Hamka is greatly influenced by the teachings of the Islamic religion. Hamka considers religion and education to be interrelated.

Conclusion and Views Early Childhood Pedagogy in the Future

Various developments in science made the debate on the philosophy of pedagogy, even more, shifted at the beginning of its emergence. If in the past pedagogy focused only on education to be given or not, now it has developed a lot into how to get all children can get an education and through what kind of approach.

The development of the philosophy of positivism that relies on concrete and empirical results has made other sciences such as social science into a science that is numbered and even often underestimated. This can be seen from a large number of early childhood education in Indonesia in the New Order era, which emphasizes more on exact things such as reading, writing numeracy. However, along with the development of knowledge and technology, globalization has made psychological sciences and education outside, which are advanced and developing, begin to be adapted and developed in Indonesia. For example, some kindergartens have begun to adapt the approach of constructivism. In the perspective of teaching constructivism, the emphasis is more on the development of concepts and deep understanding (knowledge) as a result of the active construction of the learner.

There is currently a developing philosophy of critical pedagogy which is a learning approach that seeks to help pupils question and challenge domination as well as dominating beliefs and practices. Critical pedagogy can be interpreted as critical education, namely education that always questions criticizing education itself in fundamental matters about education both at the philosophical, theoretical, system, policy, and implementation levels. Philosophical critical pedagogy is a challenge and criticism of the establishment of modernism and oppressive policies and educational administration in social situations that are also oppressive because they refer to a view of metanarrative/grand narrative that ignores local narratives. Critical pedagogy is therefore often linked to Frankfurt's understanding and post-modernism, non-essentialism. Proponents of critical pedagogy view that teaching is inherently a political act, reject the neutrality of knowledge and insist that issues of social justice and democracy itself are no different from the acts of learning and teaching.

Although pedagogy in Indonesia feels lagging behind, with the tsunami of information as it is now, it is possible that Indonesia will have the same quality of education as abroad, it's just that the problem is, in Indonesia, education is still the consumption of the privileged. The school makes a profitable business, so the price is directly proportional to the quality.

References

- Bowers, F. B., & Gehring, T. (2004). Johann Heinrich Pestalozzi: 18th Century Swiss Educator and Correctional Reformer. *Journal of Correctional Education*, 55(4), 306–319. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23292096>
- Cooper, E. (Ed.). (2004). *When children love to learn: A practical application of Charlotte Mason's philosophy for today*. Crossway.
- Dahlberg, G, Moss, P and Spence, A, Beyond Quality in Early Childhood Education and Care: Post Modern Perspectives, Falmer Press, 1999
- Dwiarso, Priyo. 2010. *Napak Tilas Ajaran Ki Hadjar Dewantara*, Majelis Luhur Persatuan, Yogyakarta
- Etymonline. (2022, June 16). Etymology, origin and meaning of pedagogue by etymonline. Etymonline. <https://www.etymonline.com/word/pedagogue>
- Farquhar, S. & White, E.J. (2014) Philosophy and Pedagogy of Early Childhood, *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 46:8, 821-832, DOI: 10.1080/00131857.2013.783964
- Gibson, B. (1928). The political philosophy of Jean Jacques Rousseau, *Australasian Journal of Psychology and Philosophy*, 6:3, 161-183, DOI:10.1080/00048402808540893
- Ki Suratman. (1987). *Tugas Kita Sebagai Pamong Taman Siswa*, Majelis Luhur Yogyakarta
- Loughran, J. (2010). *What expert teachers do: Enhancing professional knowledge for classroom practice*. Crows Nest, NSW: Allen & Unwin.
- Lucas, C. J. (1972). *Our western educational heritage*. New York: Macmillan.
- Marshall, C. (2017). Montessori education: a review of the evidence base. *Science Learn* 2, 11. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41539-017-0012-7>
- Maria Montessori (2019). *The Forgotten Citizen*. In G. Sackett (Ed.), *Citizen of the World: Key Montessori Readings* (pp. 47–53). Montessori Pierson Publishing Company.
- Moss, P. (2013). The relationship between early childhood and compulsory education: A properly political question. In P. Moss (Ed.), *Early childhood and compulsory education: Reconceptualizing the relationship* (pp. 2-49). Abingdon: Routledge.
- Nata Abuddin. (2003). *Pemikiran Para Tokoh Pendidikan Islam*. Raja Grafindo Persada, Jakarta
- Pitcher, E. G. (1996). An evaluation of the Montessori method in schools for young children. *Child. Educ.* 42, 489–492
- Sadovnik, A., Semel, S., Coughlan, R., Kanze, B., & Tyner-Mullings, A. (2017). Progressive Education In The 21st Century: The Enduring Influence Of John Dewey. *The Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era*, 16(4), 515-530. doi:10.1017/S1537781417000378
- Santín, M.F., & Torruella, M.F. (2017). Reggio Emilia: An Essential Tool to Develop Critical Thinking in Early Childhood. *Journal of New Approaches in Educational Research*, 6, 50-56.
- Sendra Ramos, S., Astiaso, P. L., & López, S. M. (2022). “Take heed that ye offend not—despise not—hinder not—one of these little ones”: Charlotte Mason and her educational proposal. *International Journal of Christianity & Education*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/20569971221086658>
- Shafique, Ali Khan (2005). *Filsafat Pendidikan Al-Ghazali*. Pustaka setia, Bandung
- Slavin, R. (2018). Educational Psychology (12th ed.). Pearson Wood, E., & Hedges, H. (2016). Curriculum in early childhood education: Critical questions about content, coherence, and control. *The Curriculum Journal*, 27(3), 387–405. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585176.2015.11299>